## Minutes of the 12<sup>th</sup> ECOSAI Governing Board Meeting October 24, 2007 Antalya, Turkey

The 12<sup>th</sup> ECOSAI Governing Board Meeting was held on October 24, 2007 in Antalya, Turkey. The following attended the meeting as Heads of Delegations.

- o Mr. Mohammad Reza Rahimi, President of the Supreme Audit Court of Iran.
- Mr. Mehmet Damar, President of the Turkish Court of Accounts and President of the ECOSAI.
- o Mr. Tanwir Ali Agha, Auditor-General of Pakistan and Secretary General of ECOSAI.
- o Mr. Jafar Hasanov, Auditor of the Chamber of Accounts of Republic of Azerbaijan.
- o Mr. Shairbek Ashirbekov, Auditor of Accounts Chamber of Kyrgyz Repubic.

The complete list of participants is at Annexure-I.

## 2. Opening of the Meeting.

The President of the Turkish Court of Accounts, Turkey and the ECOSAI, Mr. Mehmet Damar, welcomed the delegates. The President expressed his pleasure in hosting the 12<sup>th</sup> Governing Board, the 4<sup>th</sup> Assembly and the 4th Symposium in Turkey. The President TCA welcomed the new Secretary General on the assumption of his office as the Head of the General Secretariat of the ECOSAI. He expressed optimism that proceedings of this meeting will guide the organization in achieving its objectives.

## 3. Adoption of the agenda.

The proposed agenda (Annex-II) for the 12<sup>th</sup> ECOSAI BOG meeting was unanimously adopted.

### 4. Activity Report by the Secretary General.

The Auditor-General of Pakistan and the Secretary General of the ECOSAI Mr. Tanwir Ali Agha presented the activity report (Annex-III) of the ECOSAI Secretariat on the

activities since the 11th Governing Board meeting held in Ankara. He thanked the President of the TCA, the honorable delegates and the members of the SAI of Turkey without whose dedicated work this event would not have been possible. He hoped that the deliberations during this Governing Board Meeting will be wide-ranging and fruitful.

The Secretary General informed the BOG that the ECOSAI Secretariat had initiated various actions to implement the decisions of the 11<sup>th</sup> Governing Board members and maintained a consistent communication with the members states and despite shortcomings, he felt satisfied that the ECOSAI has made progress in a number of areas.

The Secretary General highlighted that since the inception of this organization, the ECOSAI members have emphasized promoting cooperation between the Member States in the areas of training and capacity building which can best be achieved by enhancing the skills of our personnel through providing them exposure to modern tools and techniques pertinent to state auditing. He informed the BOG about various initiatives taken in the important areas of training, and explained the progress made with respect to publication of the ECOSAI Circular, compiling and publishing of the ECOSAI Directory and development of the ECOSAI website. The Secretary General stressed the need for participation of all member SAIs in organizational and professional activities to achieve its objectives

# 5. Approval of the Annual Accounts for the Year Ended 31 December, 2006 and the budget for the years 2007-09.

The Director General, SAI Pakistan presented the accounts of the ECOSAI for the year ending December 31, 2006 and the budget (Annexure-IV) for the years 2007-09. The 12<sup>th</sup> BOG meeting recommended the ECOSAI accounts for the period ending December 31, 2006 and the budget for the years 2007-09 for the approval of the 4<sup>th</sup> Assembly.

## 6. Approval of the 7<sup>th</sup> ECOSAI Training Committee Report and its Future Plans.

The Director General, SAI Pakistan presented the report of the 7<sup>th</sup> Training Committee meeting (Annexure V) held on October 24, 2007 and informed the BOG that the Training Specialists of the ECOSAI had agreed on the new calendar of courses to be organized by the ECOSAI. The 12th BOG meeting adopted the recommendations of the 7<sup>th</sup> Training Committee meeting.

## 7. Report of the SAI Iran on the IDB funded training course on Essential Skills in Financial Auditing

Mr. Mohammad Reza Rahimi, President of the Supreme Audit Court of Iran informed the 12<sup>th</sup> BOG about the preparation for the course and informed the BOG that due to lack of proper response from member countries the course was postponed. He suggested that the SAI Iran can offer training in different languages according to the needs of the member states of the ECOSAI. The Head of delegation of the SAI of Azerbaijan pointed out that the low interest of the member states in some of the training courses was due to the language issues, since participants from many countries were not proficient in English. The Secretary General pointed out that the main purpose of the ECOSAI was to organize effective training programs for the benefits of its members. In this regard it is important that language specific solution may be explored by our training specialists. The Secretary General suggested and the 12<sup>th</sup> BOG recommend that the next Training Committee meeting should address the issue of language of instruction in the ECOSAI sponsored training courses.

## 8. Approval of the ECOSAI Financial Rules & Regulations

The Secretariat presented the provisional Financial Rules & Regulations for the ECOSAI, which are derived from ASOSAI Charter (Article-VIII) and Rules & Regulations (Rules 22-29 of Rules & Regulations of ASOSAI). The 12<sup>th</sup> BOG recommended the Financial Rules & Regulations of the ECOSAI for the approval of the 4<sup>th</sup> Assembly.

#### 9. Nominations for the Governing Board of the ECOSAI.

The President informed the BOG that a number of countries have expressed their willingness to be represented on the ECOSAI Board of Governors. In this situation there was a possibility of elections for which the ECOSAI needed election procedure. The Secretariat informed the BOG that a draft election procedure based on the broad principles of the ASOSAI election procedure has been prepared and provided to the BOG members. The Head of the SAI Iran suggested that, while the Secretariat may remain permanent in Pakistan, the positions on the Board of Governors should be held on rotation. The Secretary General observed that policy of nominations to the BOG on rotation basis can only be adopted after amending the ECOSAI Charter. After detailed discussion on the subject the President suggested to the BOG members that, while we should make efforts to reach at consensus based nominations for the BOG, the election procedure

(Annexure VI) proposed by the Secretariat may be recommended for the approval of the 4<sup>th</sup> Assembly to be used as and when required. The BOG accepted the suggestion and recommended the election procedure for the approval of the Assembly

## Closing Address by the President of the Turkish Court of Accounts.

In his closing address, Mr. Mehmet Damar, Turkish Court of Accounts and President of the ECOSAI thanked all delegates for their active participation in the 12<sup>th</sup> ECOSAI BOG meeting and expressed satisfaction with the proceedings of the BOG. He expressed the hope that the Assembly and the Symposium will contribute to achieving the objectives of the ECOSAI.

Mr. Mohammad Reza Rahimi, President of the Supreme Audit Court of Iran.

Mr. Mehmet Damar, President of the Turkish Court of Accounts and President of the ECOSAI.

Mr. Tanwir Ali Agha, Auditor-General of Pakistan and Secretary General of ECOSAI.

Mr. Jafar Hasanov, Auditor of the Chamber of Accounts of Republic of Azerbaijan.

Mr. Sharbek Ashirbekov, Auditor of Accounts Chamber of Kyrgyz Republic.